

14. HOUSEHOLDER APPLICATION: ERECTION OF GARAGE AT GARDENERS COTTAGE, PARWICH (NP/DDD/0116/0061 P.5867 418860/354638 22/03/2016 DH/CF)

APPLICANT: MR A PURVIS

Site and Surroundings

Gardeners Cottage is a detached dwellinghouse that lies on the hillside to the north of Kiln Lane to the northern edge of the named settlement of Parwich. The house is Grade II listed and also lies within Parwich Conservation Area. To the south of the property there are open fields, also in the applicant's ownership, which are at a higher ground level than that of Kiln Lane. A Public Right of Way (PROW) runs off the north side of Kiln Lane in a north-westerly direction 32m to the west of the application site. In this case, the application site is a walled area used for off-road parking on the south side of Kiln Lane opposite the westernmost corner of the curtilage of Gardeners Cottage and on the northern edge of the fields in the applicant's ownership.

The application site has been in use for parking for approximately 30 years having been granted planning permission in 1988 under NP/WED/488/179. In 2009, the area was extended by 1m to the south to allow cars to pull a little further off the side of Kiln Lane for safety of the vehicles and of other users of the lane. The parking area is not quite rectangular and is dug into the side of the field in the applicant's ownership because the ground level of the adjacent field is higher than that of the lane. Other than Gardeners Cottage, the properties nearest to the application site are Rathbourne Hall, 60m to the north, and Barn Cottage, at the top of Creamery Lane approximately 55m to the west of the application site but neither of these properties are listed buildings.

Proposal

The current application proposes the erection of a garage on the site of the parking area that would be created by re-building the existing stone walls around the existing parking area and by the erection of a timber frame with vertically clad timber boarding and a pitched roof clad with plain clay tiles.

RECOMMENDATION:

That the application be APPROVED subject to the following conditions / modifications:

- 1. The development hereby permitted shall be begun within three years of the date of the permission.**
- 2. The development shall not be carried out other than in complete accordance with the submitted plans subject to the following conditions / modifications:**
- 3. No development shall take place until root protection measures and planting scheme has been submitted and agreed in writing.**
- 4. No external lighting without the Authority's prior written consent.**
- 5. Minor details including confirmation of construction materials and height of walling.**
- 6. The development to be retained solely for the parking of domestic vehicles ancillary to the ordinary domestic use of Gardeners Cottage**

Key Issues

- Whether by virtue of its design and siting, the proposed development would harm the significance of a Grade II listed building or detract from the valued characteristics of the surrounding Conservation Area and/or the scenic beauty of the wider landscape.

History

1988 – Planning permission granted for vehicle access and parking area, subject to conditions (NP/WED/0488/179).

2015 – Pre-application advice offered by officers in respect of the current proposals (ENQ\25286)

Consultations

County Council (Highway Authority) - No objections subject to no garage doors

District Council – No response to date

National Park Authority (Conservation Officer) - No overriding objections to the proposals saying that:

“This proposal is acceptable in the circumstances. It would relate better to its surroundings than the alternative of cutting into the garden, and the rising ground helps to make it discreet. There is already an excavation there and a lawful use for parking, and the informal positioning of the building opening directly onto a minor highway has many traditional and agricultural precedents. Much depends on detail, but if the Yorkshire boarding had the traditional gaps and was left to weather naturally I believe that the building would look inconspicuous, especially with the use of reclaimed Staffordshire blue tiles. I suggest that each of the three walls be finished at one level, even if some of the limestone walling shows above ground externally. I would also suggest that the roof pitches should be equal, even though the slopes are of unequal length”.

Parish Council – Object to the proposal on design grounds and appearance of the development. The Parish Council consider the proposed garage would be:

- too large and too high for the site
- not of traditional style; and
- not in keeping with the area

Representations

The Authority has not received any representations on this application during the statutory consultation period.

Main Policies

In principle, DS1 of the Core Strategy is supportive of extensions to existing buildings and policy LH4 of the Local Plan provides specific criteria for assessing householder extensions including outbuildings, which is repeated in the relevant policy in the emerging Development Plan Document. LH4 says extensions and alterations to dwellings will be permitted provided that the proposal does not:

- i. detract from the character, appearance or amenity of the original building, its setting or neighbouring buildings; or
- ii. dominate the original dwelling where it is of architectural, historic or vernacular merit; or
- iii. amount to the creation of a separate dwelling or an annexe that could be used as a separate dwelling.

The Authority has also adopted three separate supplementary planning documents (SPD) that offers design guidance on householder development namely the Design Guide, the Building Design Guide and the Detailed Design Guide on Alterations and Extensions. This guidance offers specific criteria for assessing the impacts of householder development on neighbouring properties and contains a number of suggestions for the appropriate design of outbuildings such as garaging.

Wider Policy Context

The provisions of policies DS1 and LH4 and guidance in the Authority's adopted SPD are supported by a wider range of design and conservation policies in the Development Plan including policies GSP1, GSP2, GSP3 and L1 of the Core Strategy and policy LC4 of the Local Plan, which promote and encourage sustainable development that would be sensitive to the locally distinctive building traditions of the National Park and its landscape setting. Policy LC4 and GSP3 also say the impact of a development proposal on the living conditions of other residents is a further important consideration in the determination of this planning application.

As the proposed development is within the boundary of the Parwich Conservation Area, policy L3 of the Core Strategy and Local Plan policies LC5 and LC6 are also relevant. These policies seek to ensure the existing character and appearance of the Conservation Area will be preserved and, where possible, enhanced, including its setting and important views into or out of the area and also seek to ensure that development does not harm the significance of a listed building or the setting of a listed building. Policies in the emerging Development Plan Document also reiterate the need to carefully assess proposals that may have an impact on the significance of designated heritage assets.

These policies are consistent with national planning policies in the Framework (the National Planning Policy Framework) which require local planning authorities to always seek to secure high quality design and a good standard of amenity for all existing and future occupants of land and buildings; and to conserve heritage assets in a manner appropriate to their significance, so that they can be enjoyed for their contribution to the quality of life of this and future generations.

Assessment

Background

Prior to a formal submission, pre-application advice was originally sought by the current applicant in relation to proposals for a new entrance and garage within the curtilage of Gardeners Cottage. However, officers considered that the creation of a new access and a garage within the curtilage of the cottage would not be acceptable as it would have a detrimental impact on the setting of the listed building. The parking area was then considered and with the input of the Authority's Conservation Officer, a scheme was discussed that involved creating a cover over the existing parking area to form a garage on the application site. The proposals submitted with the current application closely follow the pre-application advice offered by officers prior to submission.

Siting

In terms of siting, covering the existing parking area would make better use of this space and addresses the problem that a new-build garage would be difficult to site within the curtilage of Gardeners Cottage without having a substantial adverse impact on the setting of the Grade II listed building. In this location, as shown on the submitted plans, the covered parking area would not have a significant impact on the significance of Gardeners Cottage. This is because the proposed building would be typical of many domestic garages in terms of its size and scale and being opposite the Gardeners Cottage and at a lower level than the garden of the cottage it would not be prominent in the setting of the listed building. However, the siting of the new building also means that it would be seen in the context of the existing dwelling rather than as an isolated form of residential development in open countryside.

By virtue of the intervening distances, there are no neighbouring properties which would be adversely affected by the structure over the existing parking area and it is not overlooked by any properties other than Gardeners Cottage itself. Moreover, the proposed garage would not in itself generate any additional vehicular traffic to and from the property as the area is already in use for parking and the Highway Authority has no objections to the proposal subject to there being no doors on the structure.

However, the potential landscape and visual impact of a garage on the existing parking area has been raised by the Parish Council who are concerned that the garage would not be in keeping with the local building tradition and would be visually intrusive on this site. These issues were considered prior to submission, and, as noted above, the existing parking area is already dug into the side of the field which is at a higher ground level but the plans include some further excavation which will help to further minimise the impact of the proposed development on the Conservation Area and wider landscape.

Design

In terms of the detailed design of the new garage, the current proposal includes rebuilding the existing retaining walls to strengthen them to support the roof structure. The eastern boundary wall would be straightened to give a rectangular footprint leading to a slight increase in the footprint of the existing parking area. The building would be open fronted to provide a safe access from Kiln Lane. Yorkshire boarding would be used above the rebuilt drystone wall and a timber frame would support an asymmetrical roof clad with plain clay tiles. The roof will be clad in plain clay tiles to provide a higher standard of design than a typical modern farm building. This approach was suggested by officers so that the new garage would look similar to an agricultural building and would therefore blend in with its setting on the edge of open fields and mitigate its visual impact on the surrounding the conservation area, and the wider landscape.

Similarly, the asymmetrical roof has been used along with some additional digging out to keep the profile of the building as low as possible. The asymmetrical roof also allows the ridge to sit lower than if the building had a symmetrical pitched roof and an asymmetrical roof is often seen on agricultural buildings. In these respects, the eaves height of the new building would be 2.2m above the level of Kiln Lane and the ridge height would be 3.9m above the level of Kiln Lane. In this case, the existing parking area is also screened by trees on either side, which will reduce the visual impact of the building from view points along Kiln Lane. Moreover, the rising level of the fields to the south mean that only the roof of the building and a small part of the vertical cladding would be seen in the wider landscape.

Conclusions

It is therefore concluded that by virtue of its siting and design, the proposed garage would meet the specific requirements of LH4 that deals with householder developments because it would not detract from the character, appearance or amenity of Gardeners Cottage, its setting or neighbouring properties. It is also considered that the garage would be of an appropriate design

that would allow it to harmonise with its locally distinctive surroundings in accordance with the wider range of design and conservation policies in the Development Plan and the Framework, and in particular, the proposed garage would not have a harmful impact on the special qualities of the surrounding Conservation Area or the setting of the Grade II listed Gardeners Cottage. Accordingly, the application is recommended for conditional approval.

In this case, in addition to standard conditions, it would also be reasonable and necessary to retain control over external lighting because of the location of the application site at the edge of the village where any insensitive lighting scheme would have a significant impact on dark skies and the tranquillity of the local area.

The submission of a landscaping scheme confirming new planting and root protection measures as agreed by the applicant with the Authority's Tree Conservation Officer would be reasonable and necessary to minimise the visual impact of the proposed development and safeguard trees most likely to be directly affected by the proposed development. This condition would also need to be discharged prior to commencement of any permission for this application because root protection measures need to be secured before the excavation proposed in the application takes place.

Finally, the garage would not benefit from permitted development rights because of its position opposite Gardeners Cottage, as opposed to within its curtilage, so it is not necessary to restrict future alterations to the garage by condition because they would need planning permission. However, it would be necessary to restrict the use of the garage to the parking to domestic vehicles to ensure Gardeners Cottage retains adequate off-road parking provision noting the provision of additional parking within the curtilage of Gardeners Cottage would be difficult to achieve without an adverse impact on the listed building.

Human Rights

Any human rights issues have been considered and addressed in the preparation of this report.

List of Background Papers (not previously published)

Nil